# **OFFICE OF THE CITY CONTROLLER**



# HUMAN RESOURCES DEPARTMENT CITY-WIDE TEMPORARY EMPLOYEE SERVICES AUDIT

Sylvia R. Garcia, City Controller

Judy Gray Johnson, Chief Deputy City Controller

Steve Schoonover, City Auditor

**Report No. 01- 09** 



# OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER CITY OF HOUSTON TEXAS

SYLVIA R. GARCIA

August 12, 2002

The Honorable Lee P. Brown, Mayor City of Houston, Texas

SUBJECT:

Human Resources Department

City-Wide Temporary Employee Services Audit (Report No. 01-09)

Dear Mayor Brown:

The City Controller's Office Audit Division has completed a financial audit of the City's Temporary Employee Services. The primary objective of the audit was to evaluate internal controls related to the processing of temporary employee services invoices and the charge-back of these invoices to City departments.

The report, attached for your review, concludes that internal controls related to the processing of temporary employee services invoices and the charge-back of these invoices to City departments were adequate for the audit period. However, the auditors did note several opportunities, if implemented, would enhance the current procedures. Draft copies of the matters contained in the report were provided to Department officials. The views of the responsible Department officials as to actions being taken are appended to the report as Exhibit 1.

We commend the Department for taking immediate action on recommendations identified in the report. Also, we appreciate the cooperation extended to our auditors by Department personnel during the course of the audit.

Respectfully submitted,

xc:

City Council Members

Albert Haines, Chief Administrative Officer

Oliver B. Spellman, Jr., Chief of Staff, Mayor's Office

Philip Scheps, Director, Finance and Administration Department

Lonnie Vara, Director, Human Resources Department

### **CONTENTS**

LET	TER OF TRANSMITTAL	i
EXE	CUTIVE SUMMARYii	i
SCC	PE AND PURPOSE1	1
CON	ICLUSION2	2
INTE	RODUCTION	3
FINE	DINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	
l.	BILL RATES	3
II.	MONTHLY REPORTS	3
III.	FIDELITY BOND INSURANCE	1
IV.	AGENCY FORMS	1
VIEV	WS OF RESPONSIBLE OFFICIALS - EXHIBIT 1	

#### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

#### **Conclusion**

The results of our audit of the Human Resources Department's (HR) Temporary Employee Services indicated internal controls related to the processing of temporary employee services invoices and the charge-back of these invoices to City departments were adequate and effective for the period of July 1, 2000 through June 30, 2001. We did note some opportunities that, if implemented, would enhance the current procedures.

#### **Findings**

- In verifying invoices paid to two of the selected agencies, the bill rates for the position of Health Inspector/Public Health Investigator were incorrect, with some amounts being underpaid and some amounts being overpaid, resulting in a net overpayment of invoice amounts.
- Monthly reports were not being reconciled in accordance to contract terms and there
  was no indication of the resolution of any reconciling differences for active and
  terminated temporary employees.
- In examining fidelity bond insurance certificates, eight of nine agencies (89%) did not include a "Loss Payable Endorsement" naming the City as payee.
- In our review of agency invoices, the time sheet forms that were provided to temporary employees and submitted by the agencies to the City for processing did not contain all the necessary information.

#### **SCOPE AND PURPOSE**

We have completed an audit of City-Wide Temporary Employee services of the Human Resources Department. The scope of the audit consisted of reviewing selected invoices and other appropriate supporting documentation for the period of July 1, 2000 through June 30, 2001. The purpose of our audit was to evaluate internal controls related to the processing of temporary employee services invoices and the charge-back of these invoices to City departments.

The audit consisted principally of the following:

- Reviewed written procedures and conducted inquiries of division personnel.
- Reviewed appropriate sections of the agencies' contract agreements.
- Reviewed selected temporary employee invoices and their supporting documentation including original time sheets from the selected agencies noting agreement with the terms of agencies' contract agreements.
- Reviewed the accuracy and appropriateness of department charge-backs.

The scope of our work did not constitute an evaluation of the overall internal control structure of the Department. Our examination was designed to evaluate and test the adequacy of the Department's controls over the processing of temporary employee services invoices and the charge-back of these invoices to City departments. This was a financial audit executed in accordance with Generally Accepted Government Auditing Standards (GAGAS).

Department management is responsible for establishing and maintaining a system of internal controls to ensure the proper processing of temporary employee services invoices and the charge-back of these invoices to City departments as an integral part of the Department's overall internal control structure. The objectives of an internal control system are to provide management with reasonable, but not absolute, assurance that the City is properly processing temporary employee services invoices and charging-back these invoices to City departments.

Because of inherent limitations in any system of internal accounting control, errors or irregularities may occur and not be detected. Also, projection of any evaluation of the system to future periods is subject to the risk that procedures may become inadequate because of changes in conditions, or that the degree of compliance with procedures may deteriorate.

#### **CONCLUSION**

The results of our audit of the Human Resources Department's Temporary Employee Services indicated internal controls related to the processing of temporary employee services invoices and the charge-back of these invoices to City departments were adequate and effective for the period of July 1, 2000 through June 30, 2001. We did note some opportunities that, if implemented, would enhance the current procedures.

Carolyr Y. Armstead Auditer-In-Charge

Ken Teer Audit Manager

Steve Schoonover City Auditor

#### INTRODUCTION

HR has had the responsibility for providing temporary employees to City departments since the early 1980's. During fiscal year ended June 30, 2001, the City expended approximately \$9.5 million on temporary services and at that time, there were eighteen agencies under contract to provide temporary employees. Temporary employees are used to provide assistance during staff shortages, perform special projects and meet fluctuating workflow and production demands in areas such as information technology. The Temporary Services Division (TSD) is responsible for approving and processing payment of invoices submitted by contracting agencies and the chargeback of those payments to City departments.

#### FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

#### I. BILL RATES

#### **FINDING**

Each contracting agency has agreed with the City of Houston to certain payment terms for each type of temporary employee.

In examining invoices paid to selected agencies, we expanded our sample when we noted incorrect bill rates for the position of Health Inspector/Public Health Investigator. Our expanded sample for this position included 15 bill rates in total for two of the agencies. Some incorrect rates resulted in underpayments and others in overpayments, resulting in a net overpayment. The incorrect rates ranged from a low of \$11.63 to a high of \$12.50 per hour.

One hundred percent of our expanded sample for this position was invoiced by the agencies, and approved and paid by TSD at incorrect rates. We noted no additional incorrect bill rates for these two agencies other than the position of Health Inspector/Public Health Investigator. Thus, we believe the issue to be isolated to the position of Health Inspector/Public Health Investigator.

#### RECOMMENDATION

We recommend that the Temporary Services Division perform a more extensive review of the payments made for the position of Health Inspector/Public Health Investigator and seek reimbursement from the agencies, if appropriate. In addition, we recommend that the TSD update its database with the correct current bill rates.

#### II. MONTHLY REPORTS

#### **BACKGROUND**

The contract agreement for each agency in Section II, DUTIES OF AGENCY, paragraph C, states "a monthly report will be provided to agency by the City on the 15<sup>th</sup> of each month

showing department name, division, temporary employee name, classification, bill rate, position type, start and termination date. Agency must reconcile report with their actual active and terminated employees and resubmit to the City of Houston within one week."

FINDING

Although the agencies are contractually obligated to reconcile the above report, we noted no documented evidence that the agencies had performed the required reconciliation.

RECOMMENDATION

We recommend TSD require the agencies to certify that they reconciled the City's report to their actual active and terminated employee data. Further, we recommend that TSD create and utilize a checklist of monthly contractual requirements.

#### III. FIDELITY BOND INSURANCE

**BACKGROUND** 

Contract terms for each temporary services agency states that the agency is to furnish an employee dishonesty bond for \$100,000 to the City that shall remain in effect throughout the term of the contract. The bond shall include a "Loss Payable Endorsement" naming the City of Houston as payee and the agency as the party responsible for payment of any and all deductible amounts.

**FINDING** 

Eight of nine (89%) of the agencies examined did not include the "Loss Payable Endorsement" language naming the City of Houston as payee on the fidelity bond certificates. One agency's fidelity bond certificate on file was not current and another agency did not have a certificate on file during the term of 9/00-9/01. In addition, one fidelity bond certificate had no expiration date, and the surety as well as the agency had the option to cancel the policy without notifying the City.

RECOMMENDATION

We recommend that the TSD review and monitor all fidelity bond certificates to ensure not only compliance with the contract terms but also in the event of employee dishonesty, risks of not being covered is minimized.

#### IV. AGENCY FORMS

#### **BACKGROUND**

The agencies provide each temporary employee with a timesheet that is to be completed by the employee and approved by an authorized City of Houston supervisor. The time sheet along with the invoice is submitted to the City for payment. Information on the timesheets must be accurate and complete.

#### **FINDING**

In our review of agency invoices, the time sheet forms that were provided to temporary employees and submitted by the agencies to the City for processing did not contain all the necessary information. For example, one agency did not provide adequate space on its form for the complete name and signature of the employee.

#### RECOMMENDATION

The terms of the City's contracts with the agencies require the agencies to submit all reports as required by the HR Director. TSD should establish minimum requirements for timesheets and have the Director require the agencies to use and submit timesheets that meet the TSD's requirements.

# EXHIBIT 1



# CITY OF HOUSTON

Interoffice

Human Resources Department

Correspondence

To:

Sylvia Garcia City Controller

From:

Lonnie Vara

Human Resources Director

Date:

July 25, 2002

Subject: TEMPORARY EMPLOYEE SERVICES **AUDIT; HUMAN RESOURCES** 

RESPÓNSE

The purpose of this memorandum is to respond to the Temporary Employee Services (TES) audit conducted for the period of July 1, 2000 through June 30, 2001.

We certainly agree with your assessment indicating internal controls related to the processing of temporary employee services invoices and the charge back of these invoices to city departments were adequate during the audit period. We also thank you for the opportunity of making recommendations to improve our service and internal controls.

**Details:** The Human Resources Department responses to the four findings are listed below:

#### I. Bill Rates **Finding**

Each contracting agency has agreed with the City of Houston to certain payment terms for each type of temporary employee.

In examining invoices paid to selected agencies, we expanded our sample when we noted incorrect bill rates for the position of Health Inspector/Public Health Investigator. Our expanded sample for this position included 15 bill rates in total for two of the agencies. Some incorrect rates resulted in underpayments and others in overpayments, resulting in a net overpayment. The incorrect rates ranged from a low of \$11.63 to a high of \$12.50 per hour.

One hundred percent of our expanded sample for this position was invoiced by the agencies, and approved and paid by TES at incorrect rates. We noted no additional incorrect bill rates for these two agencies other than the position of Health Inspector/Public Health Investigator. Thus, we believe the issue to be isolated to the position of Health Inspector/Public Health Investigator.

#### Recommendation

We recommend that Temporary Employee Services perform a more extensive review of the payments made for the position of Health Inspector/Public Health Investigator and seek reimbursement from the agencies, if appropriate. In addition, we recommend that the TES update its database with the correct current bill rates.

Views of Responsible Officials

# **EXHIBIT 1**

Page 2

#### Management Response

• The recommendation is acknowledged and we have reviewed the discrepancies for materiality. We have since instituted a "database" audit review at the end of accounting period 12 and at the end of accounting period 13 of the contract rates to insure contract rates are correct.

#### **II. Monthly Reports**

Background The contract agreement for each agency in Section II, DUTIES OF

AGENCY, paragraph C, states "a monthly report will be provided to agency by the City on the 15<sup>th</sup> of each month showing department name, division, temporary employee name, classification, bill rate, position type, start and termination date. Agency must reconcile report with their actual active and terminated employees and resubmit to the City of Houston

within one week."

Finding Although the agencies are contractually obligated to reconcile the above

report, we noted no documented evidence that the agencies had

performed the required reconciliation.

Recommendation We recommend TES require the agencies to certify that they reconciled

the City's report to their actual active and terminated employee data. Further, we recommend that TES create and utilize a checklist of monthly

contractual requirements.

#### **Management Response**

We have already instituted such procedures. The RFP for FY03 issues new instructions for the
contracted agencies to provide the TES with a monthly report of active and terminated
temporaries. The TES tracks receipt of these monthly reports and follow up to ensure
compliance.

#### III. Fidelity Bond Insurance

Finding Eight of nine (89%) of the agencies examined did not include the "Loss

Payable Endorsement" language naming the City of Houston as payee on the fidelity bond certificates. One agency's fidelity bond certificate on file was not current and another agency did not have a certificate on file during the term of 9/00-9/01. In addition, one fidelity bond certificate had no expiration date, and the surety as well as the agency had the option to

cancel the policy without notifying the City.

Recommendation We recommend that the TES review and monitor all fidelity bond

certificates to ensure not only compliance with the contract terms but also in the event of employee dishonesty, risks of not being covered is

minimized.

#### Management Response

• The TES section will utilize MS Outlook to monitor the expiration dates of the insurance certificates (this has been in place throughout FY02 contract year) for FY03. At the present time all insurance certificates are current and contain the required coverage and language.

Views of Responsible Officials

# **EXHIBIT 1**

Page 3

#### **IV. Agency Forms**

#### **Finding**

In our review of agency invoices, the time sheet forms that were provided to temporary employees and submitted by the agencies to the City for processing did not contain all the necessary information. For example, one agency did not provide adequate space on its form for the complete name and signature of the employee.

#### Recommendation

The terms of the City's contracts with the agencies require the agencies to submit all reports as required by the HR Director. TES should establish minimum requirements for timesheets and have the Director require the agencies to use and submit timesheets that meet the TES's requirements.

#### **Management Response**

 We have already instituted such procedures. The RFP for FY03 is very specific and clear in regards to information required on timesheets, invoices, invoice coversheets, monthly reporting forms, and confirmation forms. The FY03 RFP sets forth the standard requirements for these forms. The proposals accepted for recommendation to City Council for FY03 contained TES approved timesheets, invoices, etc.

Questions regarding this response may be addressed to the writer at 713-837-9330 or Ramiro Cano at 713-837-9350.

Lonnie Vara

**Human Resources Director** 

LV:CAG

c: Steve Schoonover, City Auditor
Ramiro Cano, Assistant Director
Chas Smith, Division Manager

Views of Responsible Officials